

# **Analysing Evolutionary Patterns in Amniote Embryonic Development (Additional Data)**

**Jonathan E. Jeffery<sup>1,4\*</sup>, Olaf R. P. Bininda-Emonds<sup>3,4</sup>, Michael I. Coates<sup>2</sup>,  
and Michael K. Richardson<sup>1,4</sup>**

<sup>1</sup>Department of Anatomy and Developmental Biology, St. George's Hospital  
Medical School, Tooting, London SW17 ORE, UK

<sup>2</sup>Department of Organismal Biology & Anatomy, University of Chicago, 1027  
East 57<sup>th</sup> Street, Chicago, Illinois 60637-1508, USA

<sup>3</sup>Section of Evolution and Ecology, One Shields Ave., University of California  
at Davis, Davis CA 95616, USA

<sup>4</sup>Institute of Evolutionary and Ecological Sciences, Leiden University,  
Kaiserstraat 63, P.O. Box 9516, 2300 RA Leiden, The Netherlands

\*Author for correspondence

## **Corrected stage scores of developmental events for each species**

In the following tables, we list the stages ('Stage') at which different developmental events occur in different species. The events are defined in Table 1. The stage numbers allocated by some authors of Normal Tables are more or less arbitrary (being numbered, for example: 15, 16, 17a, 17b, 18, 19, 19a, 19b, 19c, etc.). However, these number do not infer the existence of 'substages', as similar amounts of change occur at each stage, regardless of the numbering system. For convenience, where this occurs we have allocated a unique integer, or corrected stage number, to each of these stages. In such cases the original stage allocation is given in parentheses.

Abbreviations used for species — *Squ.* = *Squalus acanthias*; *And.* = *Andrias japonicus*; *Nect.* = *Necturus maculosus*; *Trit.* = *Triturus vulgaris*; *Xenop.* = *Xenopus laevis*; *Lac.* = *Lacerta agilis*; *Gallus* = *Gallus gallus*; *Vanell.* = *Vanellus vanellus*; *Melop.* = *Melopsittacus undulatus*; *Rat* = *Rattus norvegicus*; *Sus* = *Sus scrofa*; *Capr.* = *Capreolus capreolus*; *Tars.* = *Tarsius spectrum*; *Homo* = *Homo sapiens*.

Abbreviations used for events — *Axi* = Axial; *Car* = Cardiovascular; *Int* = Intestinal; *Kid* = Kidney; *Lim* = Limb; *Neu* = Neural; *Olf* = Olfactory; *Opt* = Optic; *Oti* = Otic; *Pha* = Pharyngeal.

Event	Stage													
	Squ.	And.	Nect.	Trit.	Xenop.	Lacerta	Gallus	Vanell.	Melop.	Rat.	Sus	Capr.	Tars.	Homo
1. Axi A	7	?	?	16	24 (18)	36 (35)	6 (4)	5 (4)	5	27 (27)	1 (1)	9	1	3
2. Car A	16	21	21 (20)	24	34 (28)	48 (47)	13 (10)	6 (4.1)	5	29 (29)	1 (1)	11	?	3
3. Car B	17	21	23 (22)	26	34 (28)	49 (48)	24 (20)	12 (7.2)	7	35 (35)	30 (29)	13	1	4
4. Car C	18	21	24 (23)	28	38 (33)	55 (54)	28 (23.1)	16 (10)	12	37 (37)	33 (32)	13	5	4
5. Car D	22	22	23 (22)	29	39 (35)	50 (49)	?	21 (12)	?	40 (40)	55 (54)	21	13	10
6. Car E	18	?	24 (23)	26	36 (31)	54 (53)	45 (37.1)	15 (9)	15	29 (29)	?	13	2	3
7. Car F	?	26	?	35	46 (44)	86 (85)	66 (49)	27 (17)	21	69 (68)	64 (60)	22	17	11
8. Car G	27	25	30 (29)	40	43 (41)	86 (85)	85 (59.2)	27 (17)	24	71 (70)	66 (62)	23	?	20
9. Car H	27	25	36 (35)	37	43 (41)	86 (85)	85 (59.2)	27 (17)	24	80 (79)	66 (62)	28	19	25
10. Car I	29	30	31 (30)	38	43 (41)	117 (116)	?	29 (18)	?	43 (43)	56 (55)	23	13	10
11. Car J	28	28	44 (43)	40	43 (41)	124 (123)	?	38 (27)	?	111 (110)	?	39	27	27
12. Int A	9	18	12 (12)	17	26 (20)	37 (36)	6 (4)	5 (4)	5	28 (28)	2 (2)	9	1	3
13. Int B	19	19	22 (21)	20	19 (13.5)	62 (61)	41 (34)	21 (12)	15	44 (44)	57 (56)	16	7	6
14. Int C	21	23	26 (25)	32	39 (35)	74 (73)	60 (46)	25 (15)	21	55 (54)	68 (64)	22	14	11
15. Int D	22	27	26 (25)	30	42 (40)	78 (77)	93 (66.1)	29 (18)	?	?	69 (65)	?	13	9
16. Int E	26	25	29 (28)	33	40 (37)	72 (71)	60 (46)	22 (12.1)	?	63 (62)	66 (62)	20	11	7
17. Int F	?	23	33 (32)	35	40 (37)	87 (86)	61 (47)	29 (18)	21	70 (69)	68 (64)	22	16	11
18. Int G	27	25	28 (27)	43	45 (43)	103 (102)	?	31 (20)	?	?	?	40	?	21
19. Kid A	17	22	21 (20)	23	29 (23)	50 (49)	22 (18)	16 (10)	7	51 (51)	24 (23)	11	4	7
20. Kid B	29	32	?	52	67 (64)	109 (108)	96 (67.1)	33 (22)	25	102 (101)	85 (81)	45	22	45
21. Kid C	33	30	24 (23)	29	40 (37)	78 (77)	74 (54.2)	28 (17.1)	21	70 (69)	69 (65)	20	14	15
22. Lim A	24	23	24 (23)	29	48 (46)	75 (74)	58 (44)	25 (15)	19	54 (53)	64 (60)	23	11	10
23. Neu A	11	12	16 (16)	14	26 (20)	41 (40)	17 (14)	12 (7.2)	7	37 (37)	27 (26)	12	2	4
24. Olf A	18	19	21 (20)	20	29 (23)	48 (47)	56 (42)	22 (12.1)	16	55 (54)	68 (64)	27	12	10
25. Olf B	20	21	23 (22)	24	36 (31)	58 (57)	65 (48.1)	25 (15)	21	69 (68)	73 (69)	35	19	24
26. Opt A	9	18	16 (16)	18	23 (17)	43 (42)	16 (13)	11 (7.1)	6	36 (36)	31 (30)	15	4	6
27. Opt B	19	22	21 (20)	25	33 (27)	57 (56)	37 (31)	18 (10.2)	15	58 (57)	71 (67)	32	14	10
28. Opt C	19	21	22 (21)	22	32 (26)	62 (61)	44 (37)	25 (15)	15	67 (66)	72 (68)	27	16	13
29. Opt D	21	24	?	27	?	62 (61)	37 (31)	22 (12.1)	17	69 (68)	73 (69)	34	16	18
30. Opt E	24	25	25 (24)	29	38 (33)	71 (70)	61 (47)	26 (16)	22	85 (84)	79 (75)	39	?	33
31. Opt F	30	27	30 (29)	28	37 (32)	92 (91)	77 (56)	31 (20)	25	?	78 (74)	39	20	28
32. Oti A	14	19	?	19	27 (21)	48 (47)	23 (19)	16 (10)	8	40 (40)	31 (30)	17	5	4
33. Oti B	17	21	19 (19)	21	29 (23)	50 (49)	41 (34)	16 (10)	9	46 (46)	40 (39)	19	9	6
34. Oti C	22	22	21 (20)	23	33 (27)	72 (71)	60 (46)	27 (17)	20	68 (67)	65 (61)	24	13	8
35. Oti D	23	22	23 (22)	25	34 (28)	80 (79)	77 (56)	27 (17)	24	71 (70)	70 (66)	29	14	12
36. Oti E	24	23	23 (22)	24	37 (32)	73 (72)	69 (51.1)	30 (19)	21	67 (66)	74 (70)	32	14	10
37. Pha A	16	21	22 (21)	25	32 (26)	56 (55)	36 (30)	19 (10.3)	15	47 (47)	33 (32)	20	7	6
38. Pha B	17	23	21 (20)	30	38 (33)	63 (62)	57 (43)	24 (14)	16	35 (35)	66 (62)	20	11	7
39. Pha C	19	24	24 (23)	25	33 (27)	65 (64)	47 (38)	22 (12.1)	17	69 (68)	64 (60)	23	11	7
40. Pha D	21	22	21 (20)	23	34 (28)	62 (61)	38 (32)	20 (11)	15	56 (55)	61 (59.1)	26	9	6
41. Pha E	?	27	30 (29)	32	37 (32)	84 (83)	60 (46)	25 (15)	17	68 (67)	68 (64)	24	20	7





## Changes on each branch

### Trees

Trees 1 & 2 are the two reference trees, based on current consensus opinion of vertebrate phylogeny. The two trees differed from each other in the position of the rat (*Rattus norvegicus*). In Tree 1 primates formed a clade with artiodactyls, to the exclusion of the rat; in Tree 2 the rat formed a clade with primates, to the exclusion of artiodactyls. MPT is the most parsimonious tree yielded by a our analysis.

### Shifts

For each event which has shifted, we give the direction of the shift ('Advance' or 'Delay') and its magnitude (in terms of the number of other events it changed its timing relationship with). See Methods for an explanation of how the shifting events were identified, and their direction and magnitude determined. Two events did not occur in the spiny dogfish *Squalus acanthias* (Cardiovascular F and Pharyngeal E). Because of the way the data were encoded, it is possible that some of the inferred changes of these two events (particularly those near the base of the tree) may be artefactual. We have therefore highlighted these inferred changes in yellow.

#### Amniota

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Olf B	Delay	Int C, Optic D			
Optic C	Delay	Optic B, Phar D			
Optic F	Delay	Int F, Kid C			
Otic D	Delay	Int F, Kid C			Limb A, Otic E
Phar A	Delay				Card C, Card E
Card A	Advance	Neur A, Optic A, Otic A			
Card D	Advance	Int B, Optic B, Phar D			Optic B, Olf B
Card F	Advance	Card G, Card H, Int F, Int G, Kid C			Card G, Card H, Int F
Int E	Advance	Int C, Optic E			Int C, Limb A, Otic E

Diapsida – No coherent changes

*Lacerta agilis*

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Olf A	Advance	Card C, Card E, Card B, Otic A, Otic B, Phar A			Card A, Otic A
Olf B	Advance	Int C, Int E, Optic D, Optic C, Otic C, Phar B, Phar C			
Optic D	Advance				Optic C, Phar C
Optic E	Advance	Int E, Int C, Otic C			Int C, Otic C
Phar D	Delay	Optic C, Optic D			
Phar E	Delay	Int D, Kid C			
Card A	Delay	Neur A, Optic A, Otic A			
Card D	Advance	Card C, Card E, Otic B, Phar A			Card C, Card E, Kid A, Otic B, Phar A
Card F	Delay	Kid C, Card G, Card H			
Card I	Delay	Int G, Kid B, Optic F			
Kid C	Advance				Int D, Phar E
Int B	Delay	Optic C, Optic D			
Int F	Delay	Card G, Card H, Int D			Card G, Card H
Limb A	Delay	Int C, Otic C			

[[*Gallus gallus* + *Vanellus vanellus*] + [*Melopsittacus undulatus* + Mammalia]]

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Olf A	Delay				Card D, Card E, Int B, Optic B, Otic B, Phar A
Olf B	Delay				Phar B, Phar C, Optic D
Otic D	Delay				Card G, Int F
Card F	Advance				Card G, Card H, Kid C
Card I	Advance				Int F, Optic F, Int G
Int E	Advance				Phar C, Optic C

*Aves*

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Phar E	Advance	Otic C, Int C			
Card D	Delay			Phar D, Int B	
Int D	Delay	Card G, Card H, Kid C, Otic D			

*Gallus gallus*

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Optic D	Advance	Int B, Optic B, Phar D			Int B, Optic B, Phar C, Phar D
Optic F	Advance	Card G, Card H, Int D, Otic D			Card H, Otic D
Otic B	Delay	Card C, Int B, Optic B, Phar D			Int B, Optic B, Phar D
Card B	Delay				Neur A, Otic A, Kid A
Card E	Delay	Int B, Optic B, Optic C, Phar D			Card C, Int B, Optic B, Phar D
Int E	Delay	Limb A, Phar E			Limb A, Phar C, Phar E
Int F	Advance	Card F, Kid C, Optic E			Card F, Kid C, Optic E

*Vanellus vanellus*

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Olf B	Advance	Limb A, Phar E			
Optic C	Delay	Olf A, Limb A, Phar B, Phar E			Phar B, Phar C, Phar E
Int E	Advance				Olf A, Phar B

[[*Gallus gallus* + *Vanellus vanellus*] - No coherent changes

[[*Vanellus vanellus* + *Melopsittacus undulatus*]

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Otic D	Delay	Card G, Card H			
Int E	Advance	Olf A, Phar C, Optic C, Otic C, Phar B			
Card B	Advance	Neur A, Otic A			

**Melopsittacus undulatus**

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Optic C	Advance				Int B, Olf A, Phar D
Otic E	Delay				Olf B, Card F
Phar E	Advance				Optic D, Limb A, Phar C
Card A	Advance	Axial A, Int A			
Card E	Delay				Card C, Int B, Phar D
Kid A	Advance	Card B, Neur A			Card B, Neur A
Kid C	Advance				Card F, Olf B

**[Melopsittacus undulatus + Mammalia]**

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Optic D	Delay				Int E, Phar E
Optic E	Delay				Card F, Kid C
Card I	Advance				Card F, Card G, Card H, Kid C, Otic C, Otic D, Phar E
Int F	Advance				Card F, Kid C

**Mammalia**

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Olf A	Delay			Phar B, Phar C	
Olf B	Delay			Card G, Kid C, Otic D, Otic E	
Optic B	Delay			Otic C, Phar B, Phar C, Phar D	
Optic C	Delay			Otic C, Phar B, Phar C	
Optic D	Delay			Kid C, Phar E	
Optic E	Delay	Card G, Card H, Kid C, Optic F	Int F		Card H, Optic F, Otic D
Otic A	Delay	Card C, Card B			
Card E	Advance	Card B, Optic A, Otic B	Card A, Kid A, Neur A		Card B, Card A, Kid A
Card I	Advance	Card G, Card H, Kid C, Otic C, Phar D, Otic D, Phar E	Int F	Phar C	
Int E	Advance			Phar B, Otic C, Phar C	
Limb A	Advance				Phar C, Olf A

**[Rattus norvegicus + Primates]**

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Kid A	Delay			Int B, Otic B, Phar A	
Int D	Advance			Card D, Int C, Int F, Kid C	
Int G	Advance			Card H, Olf B, Otic E, Otic F	

**Rattus norvegicus**

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Olf B	Advance			Card G, Int F, Card F	
Optic C	Advance			Int F, Otic E	
Optic D	Advance			Int F, Card F	
Otic C	Delay			Otic E, Phar E	
Phar B	Advance	Card B, Card C, Int B, Optic A	Neur A, Otic A		Card B, Int B, Optic A
Phar C	Delay			Limb A, Otic E, Phar E	Otic C, Otic E, Phar E
Card I	Advance			Limb A, Int B	
Kid A	Delay		Card C, Int B		
Int C	Advance				Olf A, Otic C
Axial A	Advance				Card A, Int A



[*Tarsius spectrum* + *Homo sapiens* + *Artiodactyla*]

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Otic B	Delay				Phar A, Phar D
Card D	Delay				Int B, Card I

[*Primates* + *Artiodactyla*]

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Card J	Advance		Optic E, Kid B		
Axial A	Delay		Card A, Int A		

*Primates*

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Otic D	Advance			Kid C, Optic C	
Phar C	Advance	Int E, Phar B	Card F		
Card D	Delay			Int B, Limb A, Int E	
Int G	Advance		Card H, Olf B, Optic F		

*Tarsius spectrum*

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Otic C	Delay	Card I, Int D			
Otic D	Advance				Int F, Optic B, Otic E
Phar E	Delay	Int D, Olf B, Optic F			
Card B	Advance	Axial A, Int A			Axial A, Int A
Kid A	Advance			Int B, Otic B, Phar A, Optic A, Otic A	
Kid C	Advance			Int C, Optic C	Optic B, Otic E
Int C	Delay				Optic B, Otic E
Limb A	Advance	Card I, Int E, Phar B			Int E, Phar B

*Homo sapiens*

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Olf A	Delay			Card D, Otic C	
Optic A	Delay	Int B, Phar A			Int B, Phar A
Otic B	Advance	Int B, Phar A			Int B, Phar A
Neur A	Delay				Card B, Card C
Phar D	Advance	Int B, Phar A			Int B, Phar A
Phar E	Advance	Card D, Int E, Otic C, Phar B, Phar C	Card F, Int F, Int C		Card F, Int F, Otic C, Int E, Phar B, Phar C
Card D	Delay				Olf A, Otic C
Card E	Advance	Axial A, Int A			
Card I	Delay				Otic C, Olf A
Card J	Advance			Kid B, Optic F	
Kid A	Delay	Int E, Phar B, Phar C	Int B, Phar A		Card C, Int B, Int E, Phar A, Phar B, Phar C
Kid C	Delay		Int F, Optic C		
Int D	Advance				Card G, Olf A
Int G	Advance				Card H, Optic F, Olf B, Optic E
Limb A	Delay	Card D, Phar C, Otic C			Phar C, Olf A, Otic C

[*Homo sapiens* + *Artiodactyla*] – No coherent changes

**Artiodactyla**

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Olf A	Delay			Otic C, Phar E	
Optic B	Delay			Otic D, Phar E	
Otic E	Delay			Otic D, Phar E	Optic C, Otic D
Kid A	Advance	Card B, Neur A, Optic A		Otic A	Card B, Neur A, Optic A
Card E	Delay	Card B, Card C	Card A, Neur A		Card B, Card C, Card A, Neur A
Card F	Advance	Limb A, Otic C		Phar E	Limb A, Phar C, Otic C
Card G	Advance	Otic D, Phar E	Optic C		Otic D, Optic C, Phar E
Card H	Advance	Olf B, Otic D			Olf B, Otic D
Card J	Advance	Optic F, Int G		Optic E, Kid B	

**Sus scrofa**

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Otic E	Delay		Optic B, Optic D		Optic B, Optic D
Card A	Advance			Axial A, Int A	
Card C	Delay				Card B, Optic A, Phar A
Card H	Advance	Olf A, Phar E	Optic C	Int F	Olf A, Optic C, Phar E
Card I	Advance				Phar C, Limb A
Phar B	Delay			Card D, Limb A	
Int A	Delay		Axial A, Card A		Axial A, Card A

**Capreolus capreolus**

Event	Direction	Moved against			
		Shared Trees 1 & 2	Tree 1 only	Tree 2 only	On MPT
Optic C	Advance		Optic B, Otic D		Optic B, Otic D
Phar A	Delay		Otic B, Int E, Phar B		
Phar D	Delay	Phar B, Phar E	Int E		
Card A	Delay		Axial A, Kid A		Axial A, Kid A
Card C	Advance	Card B, Optic A			
Kid C	Advance	Phar B, Phar E	Card D, Int E		Card D, Phar E